Urban Aboriginal People in Toronto:  
A Summary of the 2011 Toronto Aboriginal Research Project (TARP)

Kevin FitzMaurice, Don McCaskill, and Jaime Cidro

This paper provides a summary of selected themes and findings of the Toronto Aboriginal Research Project (TARP).\textsuperscript{1} In highlighting the areas of general demographics; poverty and social services; the emerging middle class; the two-spirited community; law and justice; racism; and the arts, this paper focuses on seven of the fourteen research topics (see page 237 for a complete list).

A central goal of TARP has been to balance recognizing the needs of a significant number of Aboriginal people who are experiencing challenges creating a successful life in the city, while not painting an unhelpful, negative representation that suggests that all Aboriginal people are poor or experiencing problems. An overall theme of this research is that Aboriginal people in Toronto are working to create a healthy and sustainable urban community—a community based, to a large degree, on unique expressions of urban Aboriginal culture.

Additional key themes that emerged from TARP include:

- The persistence of widespread poverty and related social challenges in spite of improvements in education, employment, and income levels and a growing Aboriginal middle class.
- The pervasiveness of racism against Aboriginal people in Toronto, as well as diverse forms of discrimination being expressed within the Aboriginal community itself.
- The challenges associated with Aboriginal community building.
- The importance of Aboriginal cultures and the presence of a vibrant Aboriginal arts scene in Toronto.

In spite of improvements in education and degrees of economic success for some members of the Toronto Aboriginal community and the existence of a network of social support agencies, many Aboriginal people struggle with poverty and meeting their basic needs for adequate housing, income and employment, and health. This reality of positive trends in community and social development existing within an overarching condition of poverty and interrelated social problems is reflected throughout all of the research topics. Moreover, the research has shown the existence of a diversity of Aboriginal social services agencies that are working hard to provide culturally based supports to an increasing number of clients that are experiencing complex problems and multiple needs. It was
further found that improvements in education, employment, and income levels are contributing to a growing population of economically successful, or middle-class, Aboriginal people that is characterized by a stable social and economic way of life including: secure housing, high levels of education, and a stable family life, and who reside in neighbourhoods throughout the Greater Toronto Area (GTA).2

Although not identified as a specific research priority, the problem of racism against Aboriginal people emerged as a finding in almost all of the research areas including, men, women, elders and seniors, the two-spirited population, the middle class, and within the law and justice system. As well, the research further pointed to the prevalence of various forms of internal discrimination being expressed within the Aboriginal community across the same research categories. Racism against Aboriginal people by non-Aboriginal people is most severely felt within the law and justice system, where there is strong evidence of racial profiling, undervaluing Aboriginal victims, and overcharging Aboriginal offenders. The research also revealed that Aboriginal peoples in the middle class were experiencing a significant amount of internal discrimination from other members of the Aboriginal community.

The challenges associated with the development of an Aboriginal community in Toronto also emerged as a larger theme. The TARP findings pointed to the difficulties involved in bringing together—socially and politically—people who are living across all areas of the GTA, and who are from culturally, politically, and economically diverse populations that include international Indigenous people and the new Aboriginal “ethnically mobile” population. A number of Aboriginal social service agencies have come together under the Toronto Aboriginal Social Services Council (TASSC)3 and are working to create a culturally based Aboriginal social services community. However, some members of both the Aboriginal arts community and the emerging Aboriginal middle class do not feel included in the social services and are associating more with mainstream life in Toronto. The research has pointed to the many possible contributions that these groups can make to the social services community and the importance of working to broaden the possibilities of Aboriginal community life in Toronto.

The critical importance of Aboriginal cultures in Toronto also emerged as a key theme throughout this research. In addition to the work that Aboriginal social service organizations do to provide culturally based programs and services and to host community feasts and cultural events, there is a thriving Aboriginal arts community in Toronto. The Aboriginal arts, from visual art to performing theatre arts to film festivals, are taking place in all corners of the city. The arts community has grown through the efforts of many grassroots artists and patrons, and there are a number of Aboriginal arts agencies that support Aboriginal artists and organize performances, productions, festivals, and exhibits. Overall, a significant number of TARP respondents spoke to the important contributions that the Aboriginal arts community is making towards cultural continuity and revitalization in the city.
Background of TARP Research and Review of Previous Studies

The TARP study is the largest and most comprehensive study of Aboriginal people in Toronto ever conducted. With a sample of over 1,400 individuals, 14 topics studied, and 6 methodologies utilized, it provides an important picture of the current situation, aspirations and challenges facing Aboriginal people in the GTA.

The TARP study is distinctive in that its approach to research is community-based. That is, the research was overseen from start to finish by representatives of the Toronto Aboriginal community. Specifically, the study was guided by the following principles: collaboration, community benefit, and the implementation of results. Thus, the research was sponsored by the TASSC and all aspects of the research, from choosing the research topics to vetting the final report, were overseen by the TARP Research Steering Committee. TASSC is a non-profit organization composed of senior representatives of Aboriginal agencies whose primary activity is the delivery of services to the Aboriginal people of the GTA. The TARP Research Steering Committee was a partnership between TASSC, representatives of Toronto Aboriginal organizations, and federal, provincial, and City of Toronto government officials. The following topics were researched as part of this study:

- Demographics and mobility
- Aboriginal women
- Aboriginal men
- Children and youth
- Elders and seniors
- Homelessness
- Culture and spirituality
- The emerging Aboriginal middle class
- The arts
- Housing
- Poverty, social services, and Aboriginal organizations
- Urban Aboriginal governance
- The two-spirit Aboriginal community
- Justice and policing

The TARP study utilized a number of research methodologies as summarized in Table 12.1, on the following page.
While there has been little systematic in-depth research pertaining to Aboriginal people in Toronto, it is helpful to consider the TARP findings within the context of the studies that have been carried out over the years.

The first studies on Aboriginal people in Toronto were carried out in the late 1960s and early 1980s and focused on reasons for moving to the city, the diverse challenges faced by new residents, and Aboriginal/non-Aboriginal relations. Broadly speaking, these works highlighted access to education and employment opportunities as key motivators behind Aboriginal people moving to Toronto, while also documenting the prominent barriers that stood in their way, such as lack of affordable housing, limited social supports, and racism. In addition to documenting the experiences of poverty and the many related hardships that new Aboriginal residents faced in Toronto, these early works also pointed to a number of important trends, including the growth of culturally based urban Aboriginal social service organizations; increased numbers of Aboriginal/non-Aboriginal relationships and marriages; the emergence of a minority of economically successful Aboriginal people; and the maintenance of connections to communities of origin.

Throughout the 1990s, a number of studies were conducted pertaining to special topics related to Aboriginal people in Toronto. For example, a study of Aboriginal women in Toronto conducted by Allison Williams in 1997 discovered that a large percentage of Aboriginal women, particularly lone-parent women, lived in the poorest core areas of Toronto and suffered from problems of limited education, unemployment, and discrimination. She concluded: “The urbanization of Aboriginal lone parents continues to be a factor in the feminization of poverty in Toronto,” and recommended the establishment of Aboriginal-specific services in the core of the city, particularly for Aboriginal women and lone parents.

More recently, research by Bonita Lawrence (2004) pointed to the challenges of “urban mixed-blood Native identities” in Toronto, in terms of pressures to assimilate, racism, and the experience of “invisibility” in the city. Additionally, Lawrence’s work highlighted a growing urban Aboriginal middle class, an increasing sense of alienation from communities of origin, and the need

---

Table 12.1: Total TARP Sample by Research Component

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research Component</th>
<th>Sample Size</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Community Survey</td>
<td>623</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Informant Interviews</td>
<td>436</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus Groups</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life Histories</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case Studies</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Photovoice</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Sample</td>
<td>1,424</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
to reconceptualize ideas of Indigenous nationhood to include urban Aboriginal peoples. Restoule’s 2008 study on Aboriginal men in Toronto echoed the prevalence of an emerging Aboriginal middle class, as well a decrease in links to communities of origin. Moreover, this work pointed to the development of an integrated “pan-Aboriginal” cultural identity that is increasingly prominent among Aboriginal youth in Toronto.

More recently, the Urban Aboriginal Peoples Study (UAPS), a national research project of Aboriginal people in eleven Canadian cities (including Toronto), was conducted by the Environics Institute and published in 2010. In each city, interviews were conducted with 250 Aboriginal respondents. As well, there were telephone interviews with non-Aboriginal people to ascertain their views regarding Aboriginal people, and an online survey conducted with National Achievement Foundation scholars. As an opinion-based research project, the UAPS interviews focused on the values, experiences, identities, and aspirations of First Nations peoples, Métis, and Inuit living in Canada’s major urban centres.

The Environics study found continued links to communities of origins, but that Toronto was considered home. As well, traditions, ceremonial practices, and language were considered essential to cultural identity in the city, and Aboriginal culture was generally found to be increasing in strength. The UAPS also found the prevalence of an Aboriginal sense of belonging to non-Aboriginal communities, and the growth of Aboriginal/non-Aboriginal friendships and relationships. This research further pointed to the prominent role played by Aboriginal organizations in fostering a sense of community for their clients through the provision of culturally based social supports. Lastly, the UAPS found that Aboriginal people in Toronto have little confidence in the Canadian justice system and favour creating a separate process of Aboriginal restorative justice.

The TARP study attempted to learn from the previous studies and integrate aspects of them into its design in a number of ways. First, TARP, like Maidman’s Ontario Task Force on Native People in the Urban Setting (1981), Native People in Urban Settings: Problems, Needs, and Services, took a community-based research approach in which representatives of the Aboriginal community of Toronto (through TASSC) along with other Aboriginal organizations and partner government officials oversaw all aspects of the study. Second, it examined a wide variety of topics in order to paint a picture of many aspects—including a balance of both positive and negative aspects—of the life of Aboriginal people in Toronto. Third, the study included a large enough sample to be confident that the generalizations and conclusions, to a large degree, are an accurate representation of the general population of Aboriginal people in Toronto. Fourth, the study utilized both quantitative and qualitative methodologies to gain a more complete representation of the Aboriginal community. Finally, the study took an applied approach in that it made fifty-eight recommendations intended to promote positive change in the formation of policy, service delivery, facilities, and programming to contribute to the quality of life of Aboriginal people living in Toronto.
Demographic Profile

According to Statistics Canada (2006 Census) the GTA has the largest Aboriginal population (31,910) of any city in Ontario, more than twice that of Ottawa (12,965) or Thunder Bay (10,055). The Toronto Aboriginal population of Toronto comprises 13 percent of all Aboriginal people in Ontario. Importantly, however, this figure is significantly lower than the 70,000 Toronto Aboriginal residents currently estimated by the agencies that serve this population. The growth of the Toronto Aboriginal community can be considered part of a larger national trend of Aboriginal urbanization that has been taking place since the early 1950s. Since the last Census of 2001, Toronto’s Aboriginal population has grown by 33 percent and has more than doubled its size since the 1981 population count of 13,015.

The high levels of Aboriginal population growth in urban centres is notable because, in contrast to the early years or the “first wave” of movement from reserves to urban centres from 1951 to 1971, these increases are now understood as related in many ways to the phenomenon of “ethnic mobility.” In other words, recent increases in urban Aboriginal populations are seen as less the result of people moving from reserves to cities and natural increases relating to birth rates, and more the result of the Indian Act and its recent amendments (Bill C-31 and Bill C-3), which have broadened the criteria for defining Indian status, as well as a growing willingness on the part of the general population to identify with their Aboriginal ancestry. In addition, because of the prevalence of Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal relationships and marriages in the city and the increased social acceptance of Aboriginal ancestry and identity, there has been significant growth in urban Métis populations in general.

The TARP findings pointed to a young Aboriginal population in Toronto. In spite of not including participants under the age of eighteen years in the community survey and key informant interview, 18 percent of respondents were nonetheless twenty-four years of age and under. The gender profile of the community survey and key informant interview respondents corresponds well with the phenomenon of “ethnic mobility” relating to legislative changes to the Indian Act; of the 835 respondents, Aboriginal women accounted for 59 percent of participants while men and two-spirited people accounted for only 39 percent and 2 percent, respectively.

In terms of the cultural identity of TARP respondents, in Figure 12.1 (on the following page) we see the presence of a degree of Aboriginal cultural diversity, as a majority of respondents self-identified as Anishinaabe (60 percent), followed by Haudenosaunee (14 percent), Métis (11 percent), Cree (8 percent), and Mi’kmaq (3 percent). It is important to mention that TARP key informant interview respondents spoke of an increasing participation of international Indigenous people within the Toronto urban Aboriginal social service community. Of the interview respondents, 61 percent indicated that international Indigenous people are accessing Aboriginal social services within Toronto, while 6 percent noted that they participate at community events.
In Toronto, Aboriginal urbanization over the years has resulted in diverse residential patterns and complex forms of community development and governance in the city. Aboriginal people live in many different areas across the GTA, tending to concentrate in the city of Toronto and then to lesser degrees to the west in Peel (Brampton) and Halton (Mississauga, Oakville, and Milton), to the east in Durham (Pickering and Ajax), and to the north in York (Vaughan and Markham). From the map below, we see that the high correlation between high rates of Aboriginal residency and low-income neighbourhoods is particularly evident in the areas of Regent Park, Cabbagetown South, North St. James Town, Moss Park, the Church-Yonge Corridor, Oakwood-Vaughan, Wychwood, Caledonia-Fairbank, Blake-Jones, and Eaglemount and Lawrence.\(^\text{12}\) In a 2011 study of poverty in Toronto,\(^\text{13}\) these areas of high levels of poverty were also marked by widening gaps between rental costs and income, worsening housing conditions, and high rates of crime related to drugs and vandalism (see Figure 12.2 on the following page).

A further consideration in terms of low-income Aboriginal residential patterns is that most of the support services for Aboriginal people in Toronto are located in the downtown core of the city. The western part of the city from High Park to Etobicoke, which has a significant Aboriginal population, has very few services. A recent review of Aboriginal services by Native Child and Family Services pointed to the need for additional services in this area.\(^\text{14}\)

In terms of those earning $40,000 and over, Statistics Canada (2005) reported that 30 percent of Aboriginal people in the GTA fell within this category, in contrast to 34 percent of the non-Aboriginal population. Also of note in terms of

---

Figure 12.1: Cultural Identity of Respondents
(Quantitative n=835)
the GTA is that the city of Toronto had the lowest average income ($33,000) for Aboriginal residents, while Halton had the highest ($40,000). The findings from the TARP community survey and interviews point to similar levels of poverty, as a majority (63 percent) of respondents earned less than $40,000 per year. Of the respondents, 35 percent earned less than $20,000 per year, while 16 percent earned less than $10,000 per year.

In terms of income across gender, Figure 12.3 (on the following page) shows that Aboriginal men have the highest representation (42 percent) in the below $20,000 per year range, and the highest percentage (21 percent) of those earning less than $10,000. Moreover, Aboriginal men occupy the lowest proportion of the higher income categories of $40,000 and above. Although a significant proportion of Aboriginal women (47 percent) earn less than $30,000 per year, Aboriginal women (34 percent) are out-earning men (30 percent), but trailing two-spirited respondents (44 percent) in terms of the percentage of those earning above $40,000 per year.

The distribution of income within the Toronto Aboriginal community points to the presence of a number (37 percent) of economically successful Aboriginal people earning $40,000 or more; however, a large percentage (35 percent) of Aboriginal people are also earning less than $20,000 per year. This suggests a trend towards greater disparity between those who are achieving varying degrees of economic success and those who are not; this is visible amongst both the Aboriginal population and the general Toronto population.15

---

This is an excerpt from "Well-Being in the Urban Aboriginal Community". © Thompson Educational Publishing, Inc., 2013. To order copies, visit www.thompsonbooks.com or call 1-877-366-2763.
Moving from income distribution to employment levels for Aboriginal people living in Toronto, the 2006 Census found that for the Aboriginal working-age population (twenty-five to fifty-four), the unemployment rate was higher for Aboriginal people (8 percent) than for the non-Aboriginal population (5.4 percent). Across the GTA, Aboriginal unemployment rates were highest (11 percent) in Toronto and lowest (6 percent) in Halton. Unemployment rates were higher for Toronto’s young people. In 2006, 16.2 percent of First Nations youth aged fifteen to twenty-four years were unemployed, as were 18.1 percent of Métis youth, and 15.2 percent of non-Aboriginal youth. Of further note in terms of employment rates, the 2006 Census found that Métis men and women aged twenty-five to fifty-four living in Toronto had employment rates (83.4 percent and 72.6 percent, respectively) that most closely resembled those of the non-Aboriginal population (86.9 percent and 74.0 percent, respectively).

The findings from the TARP community survey and interviews, however, point to overall higher levels of unemployment (18 percent), as well as the prevalence of full-time (40 percent) and contract positions (12 percent) for those who were employed. Of TARP respondents, 14 percent indicated that they were employed on a part-time basis. Of those respondents presently employed, a significant percentage (37 percent) indicated that they were in professional and/or managerial positions, while the second-most common (20 percent) response was retail and service, followed by working in the social services (15 percent). The fewest number of respondents were working in the trades and the health sector.
In terms of education levels, a significant majority (65 percent) of Aboriginal people living in Toronto have either some post-secondary education or have completed a college diploma or university degree; 47 percent have completed a college diploma and/or university degree, and 7 percent have earned graduate degrees. Only a small minority (13 percent) of TARP respondents indicated that they have attained less than a high school diploma.

Although more Aboriginal women are earning college diplomas and university degrees than their male counterparts, it is among the two-spirited population that the highest percentage have completed a university degree, including a graduate degree. In contrast, Aboriginal men respondents were more likely not to have finished high school (21 percent) or to have a high school diploma (23 percent).

The Persistence of Poverty and the Role of Aboriginal Social Services

In keeping with the early studies of Aboriginal experiences in Toronto referred to above, Aboriginal people continue to struggle with poverty despite improvements in education and employment levels and the emergence of an urban Aboriginal middle class. According to Statistics Canada, in 2005 over one in four (27 percent) Aboriginal people in Toronto were living below the low income cut-off (LICO) point, compared to 18 percent of non-Aboriginal people.\(^{16}\) In addition, about one-third (32 percent) of Aboriginal children (aged fourteen years and under) in Toronto were living under the LICO, compared to 23 percent of non-Aboriginal children.

Beyond low income, the experience of poverty was connected to many challenges, such as inadequate housing, poor health, addictions, unemployment, and racism and social exclusion. TARP interview respondents indicated that poverty was the result of a complex and interwoven set of factors, but that it was strongly related to low levels of education (20 percent), lack of housing (17 percent), and problems with addiction (15 percent).

In working to address the many causes and effects of Aboriginal poverty in Toronto, a range of social supports have been developed over the years and are being delivered by both Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal organizations. An important and challenging aspect of addressing poverty is its intergenerational and cyclical nature as a learned experience passed on from parent to child and normalized throughout one’s life.

Aboriginal-specific support services have become integral to the success of many Aboriginal community members in Toronto. The vast majority (80 percent) of Aboriginal organizations focus on providing essential social services to Aboriginal clients. While Aboriginal community members can also utilize mainstream services, there are unique community and culturally based aspects to Aboriginal support services that were recognized by a majority of respondents. As one respondent indicated:
Successful social service programs understand the needs of Aboriginal people and they enhance our abilities. The good programs are community driven and are culturally based. They give us pride in who we are and help build our community from our children right up to our seniors. (Poverty Focus Group)

Aboriginal organizations provide a specific set of services that are housed in a deeper understanding of the Aboriginal experience, particularly within an urban context. They use traditional culture to ground clients as they struggle with issues such as addictions and mental health. One respondent described how Aboriginal organizations provide important services that are uniquely designed to meet the needs of Aboriginal people as they transition to urban life:

The necessary transition is being a part of the community, having social events, doing crafts and community kitchens. It helps to build self-esteem. It’s things that don’t cost a lot of money, but they help build the Aboriginal community. (Homelessness Focus Group)

When respondents were asked about some of the differences between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal social service agencies, they indicated that within Aboriginal organizations there is a greater understanding of Aboriginal peoples’ cultural and historical context (37 percent), and that people at those organizations are nicer, more helpful, and try harder (31 percent).

In terms of gaps in poverty services, TARP found that Aboriginal agencies generally need to expand their services, increase funding of poverty services, and enhance programs and service promotion (see Figure 12.4 on the following page). Respondents also pointed to the need for Aboriginal-specific programs within non-Aboriginal agencies, and better inter-agency coordination and cooperation.

Overall, the TARP study found that poverty services must be enhanced, delivered in a highly coordinated manner, and able to meet a myriad of complex and interwoven client challenges that address the whole person. At the same time, they must focus on providing immediate assistance and harm reduction, as well as helping clients with long-term life changes. Moreover, the most appropriate and effective method for successful implementation of poverty services is from within a community and culturally based framework.

The Urban Aboriginal Middle Class

In considering the emergence of an Aboriginal middle class in Toronto, TARP looked at a diversity of factors, including income and economic success, education levels, employment security, and home ownership, as well as institutional affiliations and social relations. Economic success and upward mobility often afford individuals the ability to make life choices and take advantage of opportunities...
that are unavailable to many other Aboriginal people living in the city. Doing so may also involve redefining an individual’s identity as an Aboriginal person, and a change in the nature of social relations within the larger urban Aboriginal community. Individuals may shift their lifestyle choices, consumption patterns, and other class-related cultural factors. Becoming involved with institutions and taking on some of the behaviours of mainstream society may be a part of the shift to the middle class. It may also lead to the creation of new Aboriginal identities and a redefinition of Aboriginal cultures within the context of the urban centre.

A significant number of Aboriginal people are defined as middle class in Toronto. Of TARP respondents, 37 percent had a total family income of $40,000 or more, 17.3 percent of $60,000 or more, and 9.3 percent of $80,000 or more. The percentage of economically successful Aboriginal people in Toronto appears to be similar to Barrie/Midland/Orillia, but higher than other cities in Ontario. The Urban Aboriginal Task Force discovered that among the five cities studied an average of 25.4 percent of the respondents earned $40,000 or more.

Responses suggest that among the Aboriginal middle class in Toronto there is a greater prevalence of home ownership and lower mobility rates. Only 31 percent of the total TARP sample live in a single detached or semi-detached home, townhouse, or condominium, but of those who do, 73.8 percent earn $40,000 or more. Similarly, 77.7 percent of those who own their own home earn $40,000 or more. Only 21 percent of those earning $40,000 or more stated that their housing situation was not stable. As one respondent explained, owning a home is extremely important to some individuals:

This is an excerpt from "Well-Being in the Urban Aboriginal Community". © Thompson Educational Publishing, Inc., 2013. To order copies, visit www.thompsonbooks.com or call 1-877-366-2763.
We moved to Scarborough and then lived there for twenty years...Home ownership is not a priority for Native people, but it was for me because we always had a house...You had a house, and your neighbours, and you had roots. (Life History)

As would be expected, members of the Aboriginal middle class also have substantially higher levels of education than those earning less than $40,000. A small minority (22.5 percent) of the total TARP sample has obtained a university degree compared to 60.6 percent of those who are earning $40,000 or more.

Well, I guess the first thing is my education. It’s kind of funny, you know, because I always assumed that I would go to university. And once I learned what a master’s degree was, I thought “I want one of those, too”...Because I assumed it would happen and I made it happen...It took a long time, and it was something I did on my own. (Life History)

Members of the Aboriginal middle class also have a high degree of job security. A majority of those earning $40,000 or more are employed in full-time, permanent positions. It is interesting to note that the employment base of economically successfully Aboriginal people in Toronto is broader than in other cities in Ontario. That is, middle-class Aboriginal people in Toronto are employed in more diverse occupations than those living in the cities studied by the Urban Aboriginal Task Force, who tend to be focused in the social services sector.19

Like the general TARP sample, about half (45.5 percent) of those individuals earning $40,000 or more were born in Toronto. Fewer middle-class individuals maintain links with their communities of origin than those earning less than $40,000. Only 38.3 percent of those earning $40,000 or more maintain contact with their communities of origin, compared to 70 percent of all TARP respondents.

Respondents were asked about the reasons for the economic success of Aboriginal people in Toronto. The most common reasons given were: high levels of education, family and community support, and hard work and determination. Respondents were also asked about barriers that make it difficult for Aboriginal people to attain economic success. In order of their importance, the factors mentioned included: lack of education, lack of motivation, addictions, poverty, social isolation, and discrimination. Respondents were also asked about the major issues that concern economically successful Aboriginal people in Toronto. The issues mentioned included: high living expenses, lack of participation in the Aboriginal community, being busy with their own lives, assimilation and identity concerns, and the need for better jobs and stable resources.

The Aboriginal middle class has played an important role in shaping the Aboriginal organizations that serve the community. As an influx of Aboriginal people migrated to the city, a number of organizations were formed that had a social
service focus. These organizations later grew into some of the most prominent Aboriginal organizations in the city today, such as the Native Canadian Centre of Toronto. Many middle-class Aboriginal people in Toronto continue to be involved in these organizations as staff members, management, board members, and executive directors. Aboriginal women specifically have played an important leadership role in the development of these organizations. As Howard-Bobiwash discusses in “Women’s Class Struggles as Activism in Native Community Building, 1950–1975,” Aboriginal women in Toronto have a history of utilizing “their class mobility to support the structural development of Native community organization and promote positive pride in Native cultural identity in the city.”

Despite the important role that they have played in shaping Aboriginal organizations in Toronto, the Aboriginal middle class is also understood to be increasingly isolated from the social services community, as there are a limited number of Aboriginal organizations that supports this group’s needs. Of TARP respondents, 61 percent stated that there are gaps in services to economically successful Aboriginal people.

Community is based around Aboriginal social service agencies. Aboriginal people in Toronto who don’t need these services tend to isolate themselves because there is nowhere for them to get together. (Key Informant Interview)

The boards of directors who represent agencies are only one small segment of the Aboriginal population. There is a large middle class who do not sit on boards and are not clients. There is no opportunity for them to build community. (Governance Focus Group)

Other respondents pointed to the challenges created by class divisions within the community, suggesting that members of the middle class are increasingly living in distant, middle-class neighbourhoods across Toronto (see Figure 12.2 on page 242), and are reluctant to contribute to the Aboriginal community. Some perceived a social hierarchy and stratification, suggesting that educated and professional Aboriginal community members do not associate with Aboriginal community members who are not experiencing similar success:

They live across the city and stay within their own social networks. (Key Informant Interview)

They live in good accommodation (comfortable middle-class housing); spread across the city (so they are hidden); [take part in] leisure-time activities the same as non-Aboriginal people (but they may go to Aboriginal cultural events such as arts once in a while). (Key Informant Interview)
Lastly, as will be discussed in the racism and discrimination section of this paper (see page 255), middle-class TARP respondents spoke to their experiences of discrimination and lateral violence from within the Aboriginal community. Forty percent reported that these are problems in the community; many related these issues to negativity, envy, and the tendency to demean others’ successes.

When you are successful other people will always try to drag you down. (Key Informant Interview)

Your friends will do that to you. You have to change your friends if you quit a bad habit. Change your life and then your friends will say, “We are not good enough for you now?” (Key Informant Interview)

A lot of it is jealousy…Being successful is something you feel guilty about…It’s not okay to be successful…Why do you think that is? How do you break the crab phenomenon? (Middle-Class Focus Group)

The Aboriginal Two-Spirited Community in Toronto

Toronto is home to a large, vibrant two-spirited Aboriginal community composed of people of a variety of sexual orientations, including gay, lesbian, bisexual, and transgendered. It is estimated that between five hundred and a thousand Aboriginal two-spirited individuals live in Toronto. Many two-spirited respondents spoke of being proud of who they are, while also relaying the challenges of “coming out” to family and friends and the fear of not being accepted. Overall, the two-spirited Aboriginal community is very diverse—it contains many economically successful middle-class individuals, as well as others who are experiencing serious problems and are in need of various support services. Health challenges, including HIV/AIDS, remain a major concern in Toronto’s Aboriginal two-spirited community.

The majority of Aboriginal two-spirited people in Toronto came to the city from reserves or small rural communities to escape homophobia and discrimination. The life histories of two-spirited TARP respondents illustrate some of the issues of growing up in a challenging environment:

Growing up in Northern Ontario, it was a pretty homophobic environment. Lots of derogatory gay jokes, and I don’t think I knew anyone who was out up there who wasn’t made fun of or treated badly. So once I realized that I was gay, I thought, “I can’t live there [in a small city in Northern Ontario]. (Life History)
Coming out as a two-spirited person can often be difficult and, for some, it means cutting ties with family. Others have families that are open and supportive:

Most people who knew me growing up have been very surprised that I ended up two-spirited. A bit of a shock…I struggled for a long time and even had suicidal thoughts. Because, you know, I grew up Catholic…all those things were instilled in there…and then the whole family thing…I thought, “Okay, I am going to tell my mother because I need to tell her.” So I told her…and, like, she was okay…Once I knew that hurdle was over, everything else was really easy. (Life History)

A number of two-spirited respondents spoke of becoming part of the larger Aboriginal two-spirited community as an essential part of living in Toronto:

I got involved in the Native gay community first, which makes sense—this is why Aboriginal gay people come to big centres like Toronto. Because we are looking for the gay community. And a lot of us will look for the Native community, inside that community. I immersed myself in the Native gay community, and I found kinship and understanding. And I didn’t have to explain anything and that’s been really good. (Life History)

Aboriginal two-spirited individuals also participate in the non-Aboriginal GLBT (gay, lesbian, bisexual, transgender) community, have non-Aboriginal friends, and are active in the larger Aboriginal community in Toronto.

When the TARP sample was asked to identify the factors required for Aboriginal two-spirited people to succeed, they mentioned (in order of importance): having a supportive community, social support programs and services, community acceptance, and access to Aboriginal culture. Having an established community and network was identified as the most important factor. As stated earlier, being with others who understand your situation, are supportive, and share your values and attitudes, whether in the two-spirited or larger Aboriginal community, is critical to the solidarity and cohesion of any potentially vulnerable group. Participants in the two-spirited focus group made it clear that being identified as two-spirited was as important as being Aboriginal. These two parts of one’s individual identity were considered inseparable.

The support that two-spirited individuals receive from agency programs was the second factor seen as important factor for success. The work of the organization 2-Spirited People of the 1st Nations was seen as particularly significant, as it is one of the few organizations designed meet the needs of HIV-positive people, although it is limited in its mandate, space, and resources. Importantly, TARP research found a clear need for additional programs and supports for two-spirited people in Toronto, including appropriate facilities that provide safe and supportive spaces that are culturally and gender sensitive.
The third factor mentioned by respondents relates to that fact that there is currently greater acceptance of Aboriginal two-spirited people than there was previously, both in the general Aboriginal community and in society at large. Indeed, the need for acceptance was mentioned consistently among the TARP key informants. An individual’s identity and self-esteem are affected both by how they see themselves and how they are viewed by others. With greater acceptance from others comes greater self-acceptance and a stronger sense of self.

While Toronto offers many positive experiences for Aboriginal two-spirited individuals and there has been an increase in acceptance over the past few years, a large number of these individuals have had to deal with significant challenges. There remains a great deal of homophobia and discrimination against two-spirited Aboriginal people both within the mainstream and within the Aboriginal community. Of those TARP respondents who answered the question on discrimination against two-spirited people (n=200), a significant majority (88 percent) indicated that it was a serious problem in Toronto:

Being a two-spirited person is a different way of identifying in Toronto…and so we are already separating ourselves a little bit because of homophobia. So even though I am constantly asserting myself as an Aboriginal person, as a Cree person, and a two-spirited person, by doing that I am also separating myself from the other parts of the Aboriginal community. Work-wise, I try to spread myself everywhere, but socially it is impossible because of homophobia. Because I am never just an Aboriginal person anymore, I am always two-spirited. (Life History)

For two-spirited individuals who are transgendered, the problem of homophobia is particularly serious.

I just don’t feel comfortable if I am in a group of men or a group of women. When I am in a men’s ceremony, they say, “Oh, there will be a full moon ceremony soon. Go to that.” If I go to a full moon ceremony then all the women will go, “How come there’s a man in here?”…I don’t know where I fit in. (Two-Spirited Focus Group)

Security is an issue. We face discrimination and violence on public transportation at late hours when travelling home, particularly if returning from bars, or if they are not considered “passing” in their chosen gender identification. (Two-Spirited Focus Group)
Another place where homophobia is a serious issue is in the education system, particularly in high schools, where students are in the process of sexual-orientation/gender-identity formation.

It is also important to note that not all Aboriginal two-spirited individuals experience homophobia or discrimination. A number of well-educated, economically successful two-spirited people have successfully created their identities in positive terms and participate in both the general Aboriginal community as well as the Toronto GLBT community.

HIV/AIDS and other related health issues are a significant challenge for two-spirited Aboriginal people. Due to the seriousness of the problem, this topic has been researched somewhat more than most issues in the Aboriginal community. Indeed, although exact numbers of HIV/AIDS cases among Aboriginal people are not known, Health Canada’s Laboratory Centre for Disease Control reported, in 1998, that numbers were increasing significantly among Aboriginal people:

Aboriginal people are infected earlier than non-Aboriginal people, injection drug use is an important mode of transmission, and the HIV epidemic among Aboriginal people shows no signs of abating.

Individuals with HIV/AIDS face multiple issues that can seriously affect their lives. Even everyday activities, such as walking safely in the streets, taking public transit, obtaining stable and affordable housing, applying for a job, and getting assistance from a social service agency can be challenging. In addition, many people with HIV/AIDS suffer from physical and mental health problems, such as diabetes, high blood pressure, hepatitis C, depression, anxiety, and addiction.

As a community-based research initiative, TARP has attempted to give a voice to two-spirited individuals in Toronto. The research has created a picture of their lives that includes their successes, as well as the ongoing challenges they face. In many ways, they are an often overlooked group within the Toronto Aboriginal community. Some are living healthy, productive lives and enjoying the benefits that a large city with a substantial GLBT community has to offer, while others are suffering in a variety of ways. Additional research is required to more fully understand the aspirations, challenges, and circumstances of two-spirited people in Toronto.

Aboriginal People and the Justice System in Toronto

There have been many important developments since the release of the 1988 Manitoba Justice Inquiry and the 1996 Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples (RCAP); in both studies, Canada’s justice system was found to have failed Aboriginal people on a “massive scale” (1988). The reports pointed to long-standing patterns of Aboriginal overrepresentation in the justice system due to cultural insensitivity, poverty, systemic discrimination, and the larger and totalizing affects of colonization.
In 1996, the Criminal Code of Canada was amended to include s. 718.2(e), an instruction to judges to consider alternatives to imprisonment for all offenders, with specific consideration given to Aboriginal offenders. This section was interpreted in the 1999 Supreme Court decision in *R. v. Gladue*, in which the court discussed its role in addressing the “pressing social problem” of Aboriginal over-representation in the criminal justice system.26

In response to these inquiries, reports, and legal reforms, the Toronto Aboriginal community, through Aboriginal Legal Services of Toronto (ALST), has made significant advances in support of Aboriginal people involved with the justice system, and in the creation of Aboriginal spaces of restorative justice where the community is empowered to determine the justice needs of its members. Over the last twenty years, ALST has developed a number of interrelated programs that have successfully provided critical legal support to its clients, while also engaging in a significant number of national and international legal advocacy activities, including case litigation, law reform, and inquest representation. In keeping with the organization’s mission to “strengthen the capacity of the Aboriginal community and its citizens to deal with justice issues and to provide Aboriginal-controlled and culturally based justice alternatives,” ALST operates six main interrelated programs. These programs are the Aboriginal Courtworker Program, the Community Council Program, the Gladue (Aboriginal Persons) Court Assistance Program, the Legal Advocacy Program, the Victims Rights Advocacy Program, and the Youth Program.27

There is still much work to be done to address the larger social and related legal challenges faced by Aboriginal people. Those Aboriginal people involved in the justice system in Toronto are generally those who are younger, have less education, and are experiencing poverty, in addition to a variety of interrelated social problems including addictions, mental health challenges, and social isolation. Moreover, in spite of the positive effects associated with providing essential legal services and supports in a culturally based manner, Aboriginal over-representation within the justice system, as well as concerns over racial profiling, have not diminished in any significant way in the past ten to fifteen years.28

The research found that an overwhelming majority (72 percent) of community survey respondents indicated that racial profiling of Aboriginal people by the police force exists, while 65 percent of respondents indicated that racial profiling of Aboriginal people by security guards exists in Toronto (see Figure 12.5 on the following page).

A majority (63 percent) of TARP respondents indicated that there is an over-charging of Aboriginal offenders in Toronto, meaning that police are more likely to lay more serious charges against Aboriginal offenders than against non-Aboriginal offenders. As well, 56 percent of respondents indicated that there is an under-valuing of Aboriginal victims, meaning that police are less likely to lay charges in crimes involving Aboriginal victims.
It is important to note that the Ontario Human Rights Commission defines racial profiling as actions that are “based on stereotypical assumptions because of one’s race, colour, ethnicity, etc.”

In 2011, the Human Rights Tribunal of Ontario decided on a case in which an Aboriginal man was found to be the victim of police racial profiling in Toronto when he was wrongly arrested for possessing stolen property in 2003 after he was seen walking in a laneway with his “new-looking” bicycle. The tribunal is still determining the degree of liability of the offending officer, as well as the amount of compensation to be awarded to the victim.

Respondents to TARP also generally spoke of racial profiling and police harassment and referred to its prevalence in certain parts of the city with high proportions of Aboriginal residents:

It depends on the area, the part of town. In 14 Division, in the Native community, they will harass you. In the downtown area, there are a lot of skins walking around, a lot of Native homeless people. One time we were on the subway, and the TTC [Toronto Transit Commission] cops were bugging these five Native guys. Native profiling does happen. 14 Division cops are brutal, and 52 Division as well. Where there are pockets of First Nations people, the police will target them. (Law and Justice Focus Group)

Beyond being wrongly stopped in the street and harassed by police officers, TARP respondents spoke of experiencing negative and differential treatment within the courts and jails. Respondents spoke of how police officers either
initially interfered with the diversion of Aboriginal offenders to the Aboriginal Community Council, or did not facilitate their diversion due to a lack of awareness. Lastly, a number of respondents spoke of the challenge presented by the conservative nature of the Canadian justice system, in terms of the need to educate and foster awareness and respect among judges and lawyers to encourage a greater acceptance of culturally based processes of restorative justice.

The Prevalence of Racism and Discrimination

In addition to the existence of racial profiling within the law and justice system, the problem of racism and discrimination against Aboriginal people emerged in a number of other areas, including the two-spirited population, women, elders and seniors, the middle class, and men. Overall, a majority (55 percent) of TARP respondents indicated that racism and discrimination were a problem in Toronto and identified a number of key themes:

- Racism and discrimination are experienced across a number of key sectors of society, which frustrates efforts to meet basic needs and systemically excludes Aboriginal people from positions of power and privilege.
- Racism and discrimination are felt as a devaluing and dehumanizing experience.
- Although non-Aboriginal people are the primary perpetrators of racism and discrimination against Aboriginal people, there is nonetheless a significant amount of internal discrimination being expressed within the Aboriginal community itself.

In terms of its widespread and systemic nature, Figure 12.6 (on the following page) identifies places where individuals encounter the police and the court system as the most likely sites for racism, followed by schools. These locations are followed by workplaces, restaurants and malls, and housing.

The following quotes provide personal accounts of the harmful and systemic effects of racism and discrimination from diverse respondents; they encountered racism in various places:

In the legal system, you get judged. All they see is this Native person who is just drunk all the time. They don’t know my history. They think I am so violent. The Crown, I’ve known her for three years and she just hates me, she says, “You are just drunk.” The cops make fun of me and say, “Are you going to use your status card?” When I ask for programs like the diversion program, the duty council said, “How do you know about this?” He just wanted me to go through the whole legal system. Then I start to think they are right, like maybe I am just nothing. (Aboriginal Women’s Focus Group)
Racism happens with everybody, there is no getting away from it. We don’t have to be what those people say. When I went to high school, and when I heard that Native people were dirty, rotten, lazy people, and smelly people, I was in shock. People that I know on the reserve are very clean, super clean people. (Elder Life History Respondent)

I have experienced it in all kinds of places, particularly when I am shopping and using my status card. I get it from both the cashiers and the shoppers. (Community Survey Respondent)

Society really devalues us. I hate to identify as First Nations as I know what people are thinking. (Aboriginal Men’s Focus Group)

Respondents to TARP also pointed to the problem of internal discrimination within the Aboriginal community, with a significant proportion (44 percent) indicating that there are incidents of Aboriginal people discriminating against each other.

In particular, the vast majority (88 percent) of two-spirited respondents indicated that discrimination against two-spirited Aboriginal people was a serious problem overall in Toronto, and a significant proportion (56 percent) also reported that it is a problem within the Aboriginal community.
So now there’s this idea of what is Aboriginality and I think there’s external racism, but there’s internal racism and I think we need to liberate ourselves internally before the outside world can accept the differences within our circle, too. (Life History)

Aboriginal elders and seniors in Toronto felt particularly strong about the prevalence of forms of internal discrimination within the Aboriginal community. They considered the problem to be more prevalent (73 percent) than racism against Aboriginal people by non-Aboriginal people (68 percent) (see Figure 12.7, above).

Respondents to the TARP elder/senior community survey and key informant respondents spoke of how this form of discrimination is expressed in a variety of ways and connected to different individual characteristics, including:

- The unjust dismissal of Native employees
- Gossip
- Verbal abuse
- Denying access to ceremony
- Family against family
- Related to Indian status and national affiliation
- Related to class and economic success

Lastly, members of the Aboriginal middle class also spoke of their experiences of discrimination and lateral violence coming from within the Aboriginal community, with 40 percent reporting that this is a problem in the community. Many related this problem to negativity, envy, and the related tendency to demean the successes of others.
Aboriginal Community Arts in Toronto

Toronto is home to a large and vibrant Aboriginal arts scene. From film to theatre, music to fine art, and media to dance, there is a plethora of talented Aboriginal artists living in Toronto. Award-winning playwrights, actors, authors, filmmakers, media producers, curators, artists, and musicians make their homes in Toronto. The numerous arts organizations in the city, including the ImagiNATIVE Film Festival, the Association for Native Development in the Performing and Visual Arts (ANDPVA), Native Women in the Arts, the Centre for Indigenous Theatre, Native Earth Performing Arts, Seventh Generation Image Makers, and Red Sky Performance, all make significant contributions to the Aboriginal and mainstream communities.

The research revealed the many contributions that the Aboriginal arts community makes to the wider Aboriginal community in Toronto, in terms of cultural expression and community visibility, as well as the perception that these contributions are generally under-recognized. As one respondent said:

> It makes us visible. If it’s music, theatre, dance, or visual arts, those are things that people see as an expression of a vibrant, living culture as opposed to something in the past that they see in a museum. So many times people will come to a show at the Native Earth show, and they will say, “We didn’t know you guys existed, how long have you been around?” We say twenty-six years. (Arts Focus Group)

The Aboriginal arts are understood to play an important role in raising the overall visibility of Aboriginal people, and establishing and maintaining an Aboriginal community presence in Toronto. Moreover, the Aboriginal arts provide unique perspectives of Aboriginal cultures, contribute to collective community understandings of cultural meaning, and support healing and positive Aboriginal identities.

One challenge the Aboriginal arts community must overcome is the general perception amongst community members that Aboriginal arts are reserved for the community elites or the economically successful. The Aboriginal arts community contends that participation in artistic activities can in fact be a form of healing, and should not be seen as reserved solely for certain Aboriginal community members. One respondent indicated:

> It’s all middle- [and] upper-class people who go see those shows and support it financially. Whereas a lot of our people are dealing with so many other social issues and economic issues that the arts are important to them, but they are not necessarily having those conversations. (Arts Focus Group)
A number of respondents felt that the healing and therapeutic potential of the Aboriginal arts was undervalued within the Aboriginal community. They suggested that Aboriginal social service agencies could be important collaborators and partners with Aboriginal artists, noting that such relationships require further support. One respondent described how Native Child and Family Services of Toronto (NCFST) has made significant strides towards incorporating the arts into the organization:

The NCFST building is designed by a Native architect. There is a beautiful lodge inside the building. There is a council of elders, who is allowing us to build a green roof with a sweat lodge. The iconography and symbolism in between the glass walls are Indigenous based. They’ve asked me to come in and talk about the visual arts programming. I am the only artist on NCFST and they are now establishing a committee on their arts programming, so they are stepping that up. (Arts Focus Group)

Of the community survey respondents, 96 percent expressed a need for an Aboriginal arts centre that provides centralized gallery, performance, and studio space for Aboriginal artists. The Miziwe Biik Development Corporation is currently taking the lead on this issue by developing the Thunderbird Centre, an Aboriginal arts centre that it hopes will be completed by the 2015 Pan Am Games. This is part of an effort to infuse local Aboriginal cultural expressions in the games, while supporting the Aboriginal arts in Toronto over the long term. A press release from Miziwe Biik in June 2010 described the purpose of the centre:

The Thunderbird Centre’s goal is to provide a centralized home for the Toronto Aboriginal arts and cultural community. With a mission to preserve, promote, and protect Aboriginal culture, the centre’s vision is to build performance and studio spaces, galleries for Aboriginal artists, and retail space for Aboriginal entrepreneurs. East, South, West, and North will meet here to showcase and connect the very best of Indigenous arts and culture.

**Concluding Comments**

In providing a summary of selected themes and findings of the Toronto Aboriginal Research Project, this paper has attempted to strike a balance between identifying the needs of a significant number of Aboriginal people who are experiencing diverse challenges in the city, and the many successes that are occurring as part of the building of a sustainable and culturally diverse urban Aboriginal community. The areas covered within this paper point to both significant improvements in education, employment, and income levels, and a growing Aboriginal middle
class, as well as the persistence of widespread poverty and related social challenges. Racism against Aboriginal people is also pervasive in Toronto, and there is a growing acknowledgement that various forms of discrimination are also occurring within the Aboriginal community. This research also highlighted the importance of Aboriginal cultures and the presence of a vibrant Aboriginal arts scene in Toronto. Lastly, please note that this summary addressed only seven of the fourteen TARP research areas. The additional research areas are: children and youth, Aboriginal men, Aboriginal women, housing, homelessness, urban Aboriginal governance, and culture and spirituality. For a much more in depth discussion of Aboriginal community life in Toronto, the authors invite you to read the complete TARP Final Report.31
Endnotes


2. The terms “Toronto” and “Greater Toronto Area (GTA)” are used interchangeably in this report.

3. The Toronto Aboriginal Support Services Council (TASSC) was formerly the Toronto Aboriginal Support Services Association (TASSA).


12. For further review of correlations between high rates of Aboriginal residency and low-income neighbourhoods, see City of Toronto, “Neighbourhood Maps,” at <www.toronto.ca/demographics/profiles_map_and_index.htm>.


14. For further reading, see Native Child and Family Services, 2011, “Little Voices Child and Family Centres: A Framework for the Delivery of Native Children’s Services in the City of Toronto.”


16. Statistics Canada uses the concept of low income cut-off (LICO) to indicate an income threshold below which a family will likely devote a larger share of its income than the average family to the necessities of food, shelter, and clothing.


18. Of the five cities studies, Barrie/Midland/Orillia (38 percent), Ottawa (32 percent), and Sudbury (29 percent) had the highest number of respondents making $40,000 or more, with Kenora (16 percent) and Thunder Bay (13 percent) having the fewest.


21. Traditionally, two-spirited people were understood as those who were gifted among all beings because they carried both the male and female spirits. In many cases, these individuals were looked upon as a third gender, and in almost all cultures they were honoured and revered. Today, two-spirited people are Aboriginal people who are gay, lesbian, bisexual, transgendered, other gendered, and third/fourth gendered individuals. For further information, see 2-Spirited People of the 1st Nation website at <www.2spirits.com/>.


25. For further reading, see “1996 Royal Commission on Aboriginal People, Bridging the Cultural Divide: A Report on Aboriginal People and Criminal Justice in Canada.”


27. For more information, see Aboriginal Legal Services of Toronto’s website, <www.aboriginallegal.ca/>.


29. For further information, see <www.ohrc.on.ca/en/resources/factsheets/whatiscriminalprofiling>.


References


Native Women’s Resource Centre of Toronto. *Struggling for Success: Aboriginal Family Units and the Effects of Poverty in the Greater Toronto Area*.


This is an excerpt from "Well-Being in the Urban Aboriginal Community". © Thompson Educational Publishing, Inc., 2013. To order copies, visit www.thompsonbooks.com or call 1-877-366-2763.


